

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS OF ORDINARY MONTHLY BOARD MEETING OF CANTONMENT  
BOARD ALLAHABAD HELD AT 11:30 A.M. ON 31-07-2023 IN ITS OFFICE**

**Members Present:-**

1. Brig. Maninder Singh Sidhu, PCB.
2. Shri Mohd. Sameer Islam, Secretary/ Member/CEO.
3. Shri Vinod Kumar Valmiki, Nominated Member.

**Special Invitees:- Nil**

Board Meeting started on 31.07.2023 but due to some administrative exigency Board meeting was stopped in between and meeting was resumed on 01.08.2023

**1. CONFIRMATION OF THE LAST BOARD PROCEEDING DATED 28.06.2023.**

**CBR NO. 1: Noted & approved by the Board.**

**2. MONTHLY ACCOUNT**

**Summary June, 2023**

**Cash Account**

**Receipts and Payment Account for the period 01/06/2023 to 30/06/2023**

<b>Opening Balance</b>		
Cash Account Balance		19,832.00 Dr.
Bank Account Balance		11,70,01,420.12 Dr.
<b>Receipts Account Head</b>	<b>Budgeted Amount (Rs.)</b>	<b>Actual Amount Received (Rs.)</b>
13 - Revenue from property (other than taxation)	0	1,47,100.00
15 - Fees, User Charges and Fines	0	1,78,103.00
16 - Income from Sales and Hire Charges	0	2,08,714.00
17 - Income from Interest and Dividends	0	8,39,403.00
19 - Other Income	0	20,000.00
36 - Supplier's and Contractor's Liability	0	8,96,500.00
37 - Liability to Public	0	3,01,000.00
38 - Amount payable to Government	0	47,700.00
39 - Other Liabilities	0	4,42,548.00
46 - Sundry Debtors	0	13,55,521.00
	<b>Total</b>	<b>44,37,589.00</b>

<b>Payments Account Head</b>	<b>Budgeted Amount (Rs.)</b>	<b>Actual Amount Paid (Rs.)</b>
21 - Establishment Expenses	0	1,80,85,863.00
22 - Administrative Expenses/ Contingencies	0	23,31,685.00
23 - Interest and Finance Charges	0	17,355.39
24 - Purchases, Repairs, maintenance and Works Contracts	0	65,282.00
26 - Grants, Revenues and Subsidies	3,90,000.00	0
29 - Miscellaneous/Other Expenses	0	5,27,166.00
35 - Employers Liability	0	19,51,429.00
36 - Supplier's and Contractor's Liability	0	8,28,500.00
37 - Liability to Public	0	32,000.00
38 - Amount payable to Government	0	82,704.00
41 - Fixed Assets	0	2,83,114.00
45 - Stock in Hand	0	1,85,082.00
48 - Cash and Bank Balance	0	3,150.00
	<b>Total</b>	<b>2,43,93,330.39</b>
<b>Closing Balance</b>		
Cash Account Balance		10,933.00 Dr.
Bank Account Balance		9,70,54,878.73 Dr.

**Statement of Cash and Cash Equivalents as on Date: 31/05/2023**

Sr. No.	Particulars	Amount (Rs.)	Amount (Rs.)
1	<b>Cash and Bank Balances</b>		
i.	110 - 4811 - 0001 - Cash in Hand-CCB	10200.00	
ii.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0004 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 10088645160 - SBI Current Account	0.00	
iii.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0002 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 10088647076 - Pension Fund Account	0.00	
iv.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0003 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 10088647087 - EPF Account	0.00	
v.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0001 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 10088647292 - Saving Account For Income and Expenditure	90763684.96	
vi.	12 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0005 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 30564579387 - Cantt Development Fund	4115056.46	
vii.	12 - 11 - 190 - 4821 - 0007 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 39343176545 - SBI 15TH CFC CB ALLAHABAD	20653615.00	
viii.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0006 - UCO - 320100014986 - UCO BANK DEPRECIATION FUND ACCOUNT	1469063.70	
ix.	Cash in Post Office Account	0.00	
x.	Others	0.00	117011620.12
2	<b>Total amount of Fixed Deposits</b>	0.00	0.00
3	<b>Other investments</b>		
i.	Government Securities	0.00	
ii.	Bonds	0.00	
iii.	Other investments	0.00	0.00
	<b>Total</b>		117011620.12

**Statement of Cash and Cash Equivalents as on Date: 30/06/2023**

Sr. No.	Particulars	Amount (Rs.)	Amount (Rs.)
1	<b>Cash and Bank Balances</b>		
i.	110 - 4811 - 0001 - Cash in Hand-CCB	0.00	
ii.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0004 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 10088645160 - SBI Current Account	0.00	
iii.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0002 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 10088647076 - Pension Fund Account	0.00	
iv.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0003 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 10088647087 - EPF Account	0.00	
v.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0001 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 10088647292 - Saving Account For Income and Expenditure	71184531.57	
vi.	12 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0005 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 30564579387 - Cantt Development Fund	4115056.46	
vii.	12 - 11 - 190 - 4821 - 0007 - STATE BANK OF INDIA - 39343176545 - SBI 15TH CFC CB ALLAHABAD	20276359.00	
viii.	11 - 11 - 110 - 4821 - 0006 - UCO - 320100014986 - UCO BANK DEPRECIATION FUND ACCOUNT	1478931.7	
ix.	Cash in Post Office Account	0.00	
x.	Others	0.00	9,70,54,878.73
2	<b>Total amount of Fixed Deposits</b>	0.00	0.00
3	<b>Other investments</b>		
i.	Government Securities	0.00	
ii.	Bonds	0.00	
iii.	Other investments	0.00	0.00
	<b>Total</b>		9,70,54,878.73

**CBR NO. 2: Noted & approved by the Board.**

**3. HIRING OF VEHICLE (VAN) FOR UDAAN SPECIAL SCHOOL**

Reference Circular Agenda No. 1 dated 05.07.2023.

Board vide Circular Agenda under reference approved the lowest rate of Rs. 21,650/- per month quoted by M/s Shri Durga Tour & Travels, 47/1-54, Mau Saraiya, Asohk Nagar, Allahabad for 'Hiring of vehicle (Van) for Udaan Special School for collecting school children from their house to school and return back to their house w.e.f. 01-07-2023 to 31-05-2024'.

Board to note & confirm.

**CBR NO. 3: Noted & confirmed by the Board.**

**4. WITHDRAWAL OF GROUP SAVING LINKED INSURANCE PRODUCT OF LIC OF INDIA**

It is submitted that LIC of India vide its letter dated 17.07.2023 has informed that Insurance Regulatory and Development Authority of India has withdrawn Non Linked and Linked Insurance products w.e.f. 31.03.2014 and the same shall not be applicable to new members who have joined on or after 01.04.2014. The supporting circulars have also been enclosed by LIC.

In view of the above, the group insurance deduction of Rs.10 & Rs.20 may be stopped from the month of July, 2023 in r/o the employees who have joined the scheme on or after 01.04.2014.

The matter is placed on the table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 4: Considered and Approved by the Board. Board decided to stop the Group Insurance Scheme from the month of July 2023 for the employees who have joined on or after 01.04.2014. Board directed the Accountant to liaise with LIC of India regarding monthly contribution already done for the employees who have joined the scheme on or after 01.04.2014.**

**5. PROCUREMENT OF 03 NOS. WATER TANKER FOR CANTONMENT BOARD ALLAHABAD**

Reference BID No. GEM/2023/B/3661878 dated 07.07.2023 and CBR No. 6 dated 29.05.2023.

It is stated that Bid for "Procurement of 03 Nos. of Water Tanker for Cantonment Board Allahabad" was invited vide Bid number under reference. It is pertinent to mention that no BID was received and therefore comparative BID was invited vide Bid number- GeM-5116877-95671305 dated 24.07.2023 through Government E-Market Place (GeM). Following 04 bids comparative chart have been received and has been opened on 24.07.2023.

After considering the documents received online, all bidders qualified in the technical bids.

The financial bid of technically qualified bidders were opened on 24.07.2023.

Category Current L1	Category Current L2	Category Current L3	Category Current L4
4,99,995/-	6,34,680/-	6,36,000/-	8,76,000/-

Perusal of above table shows that the lowest bid is Rs. 4,99,995/-.

Relevant documents are attached.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 5: On the basis of comparative BID, Board considered and approved that Water Tankers to be procured as per the lowest bid of Rs. 4,99,995/- (L1).**

**6. PROCUREMENT/INSTALLATION OF ESSENTIAL MEDICAL EQUIPMENTS FOR AMBULANCE OF CANTONMENT GENERAL HOSPITAL**

It is submitted that new Ambulance has been procured through CSR funding for Cantonment General Hospital. It shall be relevant to mention that after procurement of Ambulance essential medical equipments have to be installed. The cost of installation is approximately Rs. 1.50 Lakh.

The matter is placed on the table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 6: Board considered and approved the installation of essential medical equipments in Ambulance at an approximate cost of Rs. 1.5 Lakh.**

**7. PROCUREMENT OF 03 NOS. 02 TON AIR CONDITIONER (SPLIT) FOR CANTT BOARD OFFICE.**

It is intimated that 03 Nos. Air conditioner (Split) installed at Cantt Board office are not working properly even office servicing.

It is thus proposed to procure 03 Nos. 02 ton Air Conditioner (Split) for smooth functioning of Cantt Board office. The estimated cost is Rs. 2.50 lakhs with stabilizer & installation.

Board to consider & approve the same.

**CBR NO. 7: Board considered and approved the procurement of 03 Split Air Conditioners.**

**8. PROCUREMENT OF 50 NOS. OF IRON DUSTBINS (1100 LTR.) FOR CANTT. AREA**

Reference Sanitary Inspector note sheet dated 19.05.2023 and CBR No: 07 dated 29.05.2023.

Bid for "Procurement of 50 Nos. of Iron Dustbins (1100 ltr.) for Cantt. Area" was invited vide Bid number- GeM 2023/B/3698616 dated 15.07.2023 through Government E-Market Place (GeM). Following 08 bids has been received and opened on 24.07.2023.

Sl. No.	Name of Firm	Address	Bid Amount (Rs.)	Bid Rank
1.	ASR TRADING COMPANY	Rajendra Niketan, Chaman Vihar Colony, Aligarh Road, Hathras, Uttar Pradesh-204101, (UP)	8,49,950/-	L1
2.	EASTERN CHEMICAL CENTRE	Ghaziabad (UP)	9,31,250/-	L2
3.	JAGDAMBA SHAKTI ENTERPRISES	Gorakhpur (UP)	9,49,900/-	L3
4.	UMA TRADERS	Phaphamau, Allahabad (UP)	10,45,000/-	L4
5.	C.V. ASSOCIATE	Mahruhdeeh, Hathigahan, Phaphamau, Allahabad, 211013 (UP)	11,45,000/-	L5
6.	SRS ENGINEERING	East Delhi	12,15,000/-	L6
7.	BALAJI INTERNATIONAL	West medinipur, West Bengal - 721301	13,33,950/-	L7
8.	KGN ENVIRONMENT INDUSTRIES	Sirsa, Haryana	15,89,300/-	L8

After considering the documents received on line, all bidders qualified in the technical bidding.

The financial bid of technically qualified bidder were opened on 24.07.2023.

Sl. No.	Name of Firm & Address	Total Price (Rs.)	Awarded
1.	ASR TRADING COMPANY, Rajendra Niketan, Chaman Vihar Colony, Aligarh Road, Hathras, Uttar Pradesh-204101, (UP)	8,49,950/-	L1

Perusal of above table shows that ASR Trading Company, Rajendra Niketan, Chaman Vihar Colony, Aligarh Road, Hathras, Uttar Pradesh-204101, (UP) has quoted the lowest bid of Rs. 8,49,950/-.

Relevant documents are attached.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 8: Board considered and approved the procurement of 50 iron dustbins (1100 ltrs) from ASR Trading Company, Rajendra Niketan, Chaman Vihar Colony, Aligarh Road, Hathras, Uttar Pradesh-204101, (UP) as the firm has quoted the lowest Bid.**

**9. LAYING OF CARPET GRASS AND PROCUREMENT OF ROLLER FOR PLAY GROUND SITUATED AT CANTT. HIGH SCHOOL, SADAR BAZAR, NEW CANTT. ALLAHABAD.**

Administrative approval of Board is solicited for laying of carpet grass in play ground of Cantt. High School at estimated cost of Rs. 3,00,000/-.

It is intimated that there is requirement of 01 No. Roller for periodic leveling of the play ground. Estimated cost of procurement of 01 No. Roller is Rs. 60,000/-

Board to approve the bill and estimated cost.

**CBR NO. 9: Considered and approved the laying of carpet grass in play ground of Cantt. High School at estimated cost of Rs. 3,00,000/ and procurement of 01 Roller for periodic leveling of the play ground.**

**10. CONSTRUCTION OF SUB POST OFFICE BUILDING IN SY. NO. 303, NEW CANTT, ALLAHABAD.**

Reference Building Application No. BPA-APP-ALLA-2023-03-02-001557 of Office of SSoPs, Head Post Office, Department of Post, Civil Lines, Allahabad 211001.

Vide application under reference received on OBPAS Module, Office of SSoPs, Head Post Office, Department of Post, Civil Lines, Allahabad has applied for approval of building plan

Building plans submitted by Office of SSoPs, Head Post Office, Department of Post, Civil Lines, Allahabad are in consonance with the provisions of Building Byelaws of Allahabad Cantonment Board.

Site for the proposed construction comprises Sy. No. 303, New Cantt, Allahabad and is situated outside notified civil area. As per General Land Register maintained by DEO Allahabad Circle, Allahabad, the site measuring 0.47 acre comprising GLR Sy. No. 303, Chaitham Lines, Old Cantt, Allahabad classified as B-1 land described as P & T Colony. Holder of Occupancy Rights is recorded in the name of the Ministry of Communication and Management as Others.

As per Section 238 (3) of Cantonments Act, 2006, Board, before sanctioning the erection or re-erection of a building on land which is under the management of the Defence Estates Officer, shall refer the application to the Defence Estates Officer for ascertaining whether there is any objection on the part of the Government to such erection or re-erection; and the Defence Estates Officer shall return the application together with his report thereon to the Board within thirty days after it has been received by him.

Since the subject site is not placed under the management of Defence Estates Office, building application has not been referred to the Defence Estates Office, Allahabad Circle, Allahabad.

Relevant documents are placed on the Table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 10: Board considered and approved the Building plan (Building Application No. BPA-APP-ALLA-2023-03-02-001557) submitted by Office of SSoPs, Head Post Office, Department of Post, Civil Lines, Allahabad for construction of building on Survey No. 303, New Cantt, Allahabad.**

**11. UNAUTHORIZED CONSTRUCTION IN BUNGALOW NO. 10, CARIAPPA ROAD COMPRISING SY. NO. 211, NEW CANTT, ALLAHABAD**

Reference Cantonment Board letter dated 26.07.2023, letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal S/o Late Shri Radhey Shyam, B. No. 10 Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad, Cantonment Board Show Cause Notice bearing No. Z-104/CBA/2023/579 dated 26.04.2023 and CBR No. 09 dated 24.02.2023.

Site comprising Sy. No. 211, Bungalow No. 10, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad was inspected by the Engineering section of this office and vide report dated 25.09.2019 reported that the occupier has made unauthorised constructions by constructing two rooms in an area 310.625 Sq. ft without necessary permissions from competent authority.

As per the General Land Register (G.L.R.) maintained by Defence Estates Officer, Allahabad Circle comprises Sy. No. 211, Cariappa Road, New Cantt which has been described as Bungalow No. 10 classified as B-3 land situated outside notified civil area under the management of Defence Estates Officer, Allahabad Circle. Subject land admeasuring 4.260 acres is held on Lease on Form B of Cantt Code, 1912 for perpetuity. Holder of Occupancy Rights is recorded in name of Shri Radhey Shyam S/o Shri Pitamber Nath.

Based on site inspection report dated 25.09.2019, stop erection notice (SEN) was issued to Shri Radhey Shyam (Recorded HOR), B. No. 10, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad on 25.09.2019 mentioning therein that you are making unauthorised construction attracting provisions of Section 235 and 238 of the Cantonments Act, 2006 within premises of Bungalow No. 10, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad to stop further construction.

In response to the said notice, Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal S/o Late Shri Radhey Shyam Agrawal vide letter dated 28.10.2019 intimated that Shri Radhey Shyam Agrawal has expired and he is son & one of legal heirs of Late Shri Radhey Shyam Agrawal. Further, he claimed that construction referred to in notice dated 25.09.2019 is a Kothari (Quarter type structure) as outhouse of Bungalow. He further claimed that there is no increase or decrease in original area of structure and there is no change in length, breadth & height of structure.

Since, the premises is situated outside the notified civil area, the matter was placed before the Cantonment Board for consideration. Board vide Cantt Board Resolution (CBR) No. 28 dated 27.11.2019 approved that for unauthorised construction, notice under Section 248 of the Cantonment Act, 2006 be issued to HOR/ Occupier of B. No. 10, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad. Accordingly, a notice under Section 248 of the Cantonment Act, 2006 dated 24.12.2019 was issued to Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal (Occupier), B. No. 10, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad by enclosing copy of GLR extract, site inspection report, site photographs and CBR No. 28 dated 27.11.2019.

Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal (Occupier), B. No. 10, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad vide letter dated 20.01.2020 preferred an appeal under Section 340 of Cantonments Act, 2006 against notice under section 248 (1) of Cantonments Act, 2006 dated 24.12.2019 issued by the Cantonment Board.

Appeal was considered by the Appellate Authority and Appeal was designated as Appeal No. 01 of 2020. After following the due process, the appeal has been disposed in the favour of the appellant vide order dated 11.01.2023. However, Appellate Authority vide Order dated 11.01.2023 gave liberty to Cantonment Board to start afresh in the case.

Entire matter was referred to the Board and Board vide CBR No. 09 dated 24.02.2023 decided to issue fresh notice in the subject case.

In compliance of CBR No. 09 dated 24.02.2023, Cantonment Board vide letter No. Z-104/CBA/2023/579 dated 26.04.2023 requested Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal S/o Late Shri Radhey Shyam to show cause within 30 days, as to why the unauthorized structure erected by him, which is detailed in the said show cause notice, may not be demolished.

Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal S/o Late Shri Radhey Shyam vide letter dated 23.05.2023 submitted his reply against the subject show cause notice. Each para of the said letter is reproduced below:

- 1. That your captioned show cause notice dated April 26, 2023 is defective and invalid as it does not mention the provisions of the Cantonments Act, 2006 under which it has been issued.*
- 2. That structure under the Show Cause notice is very old existing since the time immemorial and undersigned has not made any construction as alleged in the Captioned notice and in any view of the matter the construction existing at the site did not attract any provision or could be said to be in violation of Cantonment Act, 2006.*

3. *That with the passage of time, the room in question, covered with Khapadas (Earthen Tiles) was in the advanced stage of dilapidation and deterioration and could collapse any time causing loss of life and limb and therefore undersigned undertook repairing, on an emergency basis, of roof of the existing structure by putting up some old Khapdas, bamboos and pieces of old Asbestos Sheet in part of the Kothari. No RCC slab or brick slab was laid on the roof of the structure. The roof was just restored to its original condition. Repairing of badly cracked walls and replacement of the fallen wall bricks was also done. Thus no change was made in the original structure whatsoever.*

*Please refer judgment of Hon'ble Allahabad High Court in the case of: Ram Swaroop Gupta VS Cantonment Board, Lucknow, AIR 1961, Ald 263, Lucknow Bench. Copy of the judgment is attached herewith.*

4. *That aforesaid repair neither increased nor diminished the original area of the structure. Thus there is no change in the length, breadth and height of the structure. Also there is no change or alteration of any kind in the original shape of the structure.*
5. *That thus no unauthorized construction has been made on the open land or otherwise in our premises in violation of The Cantonments Act, 2006.*
6. *That two pictures of the Kothari / quarter in question is attached herewith. It shows that back portion of the existing Kothari/ quarter was repaired while front portion remains as it is. Thus no change was made in the original structure whatsoever. Undersigned has not constructed any new room/new construction as alleged in the notice.*
7. *The Site Inspection as described in the "Site Inspection Report" dated 25/09/2019, attached with impugned Show Cause notice dated 26-04-2023 contains erroneous information. There was no new construction in the premises, this was repair of the existing Quarter (room). Moreover, inspection was done in absence of undersigned or other legal heirs. Had inspection been done in the presence of the undersigned he could have clarified the matter to the inspecting team then and there.*
8. *That no new construction was made over and above the bungalow No.10, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad 211001. The structure in question was a dilapidated old Kothari existing since last several decades part of which was likely to collapse in the rainy season during the month of July and August 2019. This fact even could be verified from the residents of the nearby areas. Statement to this effect have been obtained from residents of the nearby area and also from the resident of the Kothari (Quarter) in question in the form of affidavit. Original affidavits has already been filed with the Appellate Authority GOC-in-Chief, the Command Central Command, Lucknow along with my "Written Argument" dated January 27, 2021 during Appeal Proceeding. Copy of these affidavits was simultaneously forwarded to you too at that time. However, copy of these affidavits is again enclosed herewith for your ready reference.*

*Please refer the Judgment of Hon'ble Allahabad High Court in the case of: Ram Swaroop Gupta VS Cantonment Board, Lucknow, AIR 1961, Ald263, Lucknow Bench. Copy of the judgment is attached herewith.*

9. *That Deputy Director (Q&C), Ministry of Defence, vide instructions / Guidelines bearing No. 2 (2) 2018-D (Q&C) dated 10/12/2019 has furnish clarification on the Section 235 of the Cantonments Act, 2006 which deals with circumstances where permission is to be sought for erection and re-erection. This notification lists out the nature of work for which notice for sanction of erection or re-erection u/s 235 of the Cantonments Act, 2006 is not required. The list inter alia includes:*

*"(e) minor repairs and recasting of an existing damaged roof, without changing the character and dimension of such roof;*

*(i) replacing of fallen bricks and stones;"*

*The repair work undertaken by the undersigned falls into the above categories and as such no notice under section 235 was required to be given by the appellant. Copy of this guideline is enclosed herewith for your ready reference.*

10. *That undersigned was not afforded any opportunity of being heard personally before the issuance of notice dated 24-12-2019 under section 248(1) of the Cantonments Act, 2006 to him. In the interest of natural justice such opportunity should have been afforded.*

11. *That in any view of the matter the alleged construction / repair cannot be construed to be an unauthorized construction and as such does not constitute any offence attracting the provisions of the Cantonments Act, 2006. No permission whatsoever is required for such erection or re- erection in the facts and the circumstances of the submission made in the preceding paragraphs. Therefore, there was no occasion to give a notice under section 235 of the Cantonments Act, 2006 seeking sanction for erection or re-erection. Thus, the repair work undertaken by the appellant is not coming within the definition of the erection or re-erection as provided in the Cantonments Act, 2006.*

*Thus no offence under section 247 and other provisions of the Cantonments Act, 2006 is made out against the undersigned.*

12. *That undersigned in the preceding paragraphs of this reply has invariably stated that no new construction/erection/re-erection has been done in the premises of 10, Cariappa Road, Allahabad. However, if still it is felt by the Board that there is some element of erection or re- erection in aforesaid repair then a sum as the Board thinks reasonable by way of composition under section 248 of the Cantonments Act, 2006 may please be accepted from the undersigned, instead of issuing direction for demolition.*

Cantonment Board vide letter dated 26.07.2023 has submitted para wise reply on letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal. Comments of Cantonment Board on each para have been reproduced below:

- I. That, the contents of Para 1 of letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are totally misconceived and incorrect, hence denied. In reply thereto, it is stated that show cause notice dated 26.04.2023 has been issued in accordance with provisions Cantonments Act, 2006, directions of Hon'ble Supreme Court, Hon'ble High Court in Afzal Case and Hon'ble Appellate Authority (GOC-in-C, CC, Lucknow) Order dated 11.01.2023. It is submitted that show cause notice dated 26.04.2023 is legal and valid.
- II. That, the contents of Para 2,3,4,5 and 6 of letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are totally misconceived and incorrect, hence denied. In reply thereto, it is stated that unauthorized construction involved in the present controversy is fresh construction carried out by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal on vacant defence land and it is not a repair work.

It is submitted that a bare perusal of the site inspection report dated 25.09.2019 and the site photographs itself clarify the extent of unauthorized construction at the site. Photograph of unauthorized construction taken during course of site inspection on 25.09.2019 clearly shows that it is a fresh construction.

It is wholly misconceived to say that construction made by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal does not attract any provision or violation of Cantonments Act, 2006. It is submitted that prior permission of Competent Authority is required for carrying out fresh construction on defence land as per Cantonments Act, 2006 and extant rules/ policy.

The citation of the case of "Ram Swaroop Gupta vs. Cantonment Board" is not applicable in the subject case as in the present case fresh construction has been carried out by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal.

Unauthorized construction involved in present controversy is fresh construction made by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal in premises of Bungalow No. 10, Sy. No. 211, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad without taking necessary permission of the Competent Authority i.e. Cantonment Board. As such section 235 of the Cantonments Act, 2006 is fully applicable in the present case and proceedings initiated against Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal is just and legal.

- III. That, the contents of Para 7 of letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are totally misconceived and incorrect, hence denied. In reply thereto, it is stated that an inspection of the site was made by the Engineering Section of Cantonment Board Allahabad on 25.09.2019 and a report was submitted on the same date with regard to the site in question and it was reported that in an area of 310.625 square feet unauthorized construction (one room measuring 11'9" X 13'1.5" and one room measuring 11'11" X 13'1.5") has been made by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal. It is submitted that the said site inspection was carried out in the presence of occupiers present at the site.



- IV. That, the contents of Para 8 of letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are totally misconceived and incorrect, hence denied. In reply thereto, it is stated that unauthorized construction involved in present controversy is fresh construction made by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal in premises of Bungalow No. 10, Sy. No. 211, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad without taking necessary permission of the Competent Authority i.e. Cantonment Board.

With respect to the Affidavits of five persons (residents of nearby area) submitted by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal, it is submitted that all five persons are closely connected with Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal and have not given the correct version regarding construction of two rooms as photographs of unauthorized construction taken during course of site inspection on 25.09.2019 clearly show that it is a fresh construction. As such, statements of said five persons are not trustworthy.

- V. That, the contents of Para 9 of letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are totally misconceived and incorrect, hence denied. In reply thereto, it is stated that Government Policy, Ministry of Defence ID. No.2(2)/018-D(Q&C) dated 10.12.2019 regarding repairs to authorized buildings in Cantonment Area is not applicable in the present case because unauthorized construction carried out by the appellant is not a repair work rather it is a fresh construction. As such, Section 235 of the Cantonments Act, 2006 is fully applicable in the present case. Photographs of unauthorized construction taken during course of site inspection on 25.09.2019 clearly show that it is a fresh construction.
- VI. That, the contents of Para 10 of letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are totally misconceived and incorrect, hence denied. In reply thereto, it is submitted that opportunity for personal hearing may be provided to Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal in the instant proceedings.
- VII. That, the contents of Para 11 of letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are totally misconceived and incorrect, hence denied. In reply thereto, it is stated that it is wholly misconceived to say that construction made by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal does not attract any provision or violation of Cantonments Act, 2006. It is submitted that prior permission of Competent Authority is required for carrying out fresh construction on defence land as per Cantonments Act, 2006 and extant rules/ policy. Unauthorized construction involved in present controversy is fresh construction made by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal in premises of Bungalow No. 10, Sy. No. 211, Cariappa Road, New Cantt, Allahabad without taking necessary permission of the Competent Authority i.e. Cantonment Board as per Section 235 of the Cantonments Act, 2006.

Further, as per Section 247 (a) of the Cantonments Act, 2006, whoever begins, continues or completes the erection or re-erection of a building without having given a valid notice as required by sections 235 and 236, or before the building has been sanctioned or is deemed to have been sanctioned shall be punishable with fine which may extend to fifty thousand rupees and the cost of sealing the illegal construction and its demolition.

As such Section 247 of the Cantonments Act, 2006 is fully applicable in the present case and proceedings initiated against Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are just and legal.

- VIII. That, the contents of Para 12 of letter dated 23.05.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal are totally misconceived and incorrect, hence denied. In reply thereto, it is reiterated that construction in question is a fresh construction which constitutes violation of provisions of the Cantonments Act, 2006. It is submitted that no application for compounding of unauthorized construction along with requisite plans and documents has been submitted by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal.

Relevant files are placed on the Table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 11: Board considered the application dated 28.07.2023 of Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal regarding grant of 15 days time for hearing. Board decided to provide another opportunity to Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal for the hearing on 18.08.2023 and in case of non-appearance by Shri Naresh Chandra Agrawal on next hearing date, Board will decide the case on merit.**

**12. GRANT OF WORKING PERMISSION TO IRRIGATION AND WATER RESOURCES DEPARTMENT, PRAYAGRAJ (STATE GOVT. OF UTTAR PRADESH) FOR CONSTRUCTION OF PUCCA GHAT ON YAMUNA RIVER BANK AT PRAYAGRAJ TO PROVIDE TOURISM FACILITIES TO PILGRIMS ARRIVING AT SANGAM DURING MAHAKUMBH-2025 AND NORMAL COURSE ALSO**

Reference Working Permission issued by Govt. of India, Ministry of Defence, New Delhi vide ID No. 13015/20/2023/D(Lands) dated 18.07.2023.

Ministry of Defence vide letter under reference has conveyed the sanction of President of India for grant of Working Permission to Irrigation and Water Resources Department, Prayagraj (State Govt. of Uttar Pradesh) on defence land measuring 0.1650 hectare or 0.4077 acre out of GLR Survey No. 114 (B-4; DEO Management) at Fort Cantt. Allahabad on the basis of creation of Equal Value Infrastructure (EVI) amounting to Rs. 4,40,59,950/- in lieu of defence land for construction of Pucca Ghat on Yamuna river bank to provide tourism facilities to pilgrims arriving at sangam during Mahakumbh-2025 and normal course also.

Working permission to Irrigation and Water Resource Department, Prayagraj on defence land measuring 0.1650 hectare or 0.4077 acre valued at Rs. 4,40,59,950/- is on basis of creation of EVI, which shall accrue to the Cantonment Board Allahabad.

Copy of Working Permission issued by Govt. of India, Ministry of Defence, New Delhi ID No. 13015/20/2023/D(Lands) dated 18.07.2023 is placed on the Table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 12: Board decided to prepare DPR for following three projects for Equal Value Infrastructure (EVI):**

- a) Provision of additional rooms in Vicker Public School
- b) Provision of additional rooms in RAB Public School
- c) Provision of Gate and allied structures on Akbar Road (near Ponappa Road crossing)

**13. ONE DAY LECTURE UNDER RAJBHASHA TO PROMOTE THE USE OF HINDI LANGUAGE IN GOVERNMENT OFFICES AS PER DIRECTION OF RAJBHASHA SAMITI**

It is submitted that one day lecture was organized at the office of the PCDA (pensions) on 23.06.2023 to promote the use of Hindi language in government offices. The lecture was jointly organized by the Cantonment Board Allahabad & Defence Estates Office. 50% of the total expenditure incurred for organizing the lecture to be incurred by the Cantt. Board is Rs. 84,068/-

Matter is placed on the table. Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 13: Board considered and approved the payment of 50% of the total expenditure amounting to Rs.84,068/- incurred for organizing the lecture under Rajbhasha.**

**14. PAYMENT GATEWAY FOR E-CHHAWANI PORTAL**

Reference PDDE, CC letter No. 83/62/DGDE/IT/e-Chhawani/PG dated 11.07.2023. Cantonment Board Allahabad has been integrated on PayGov India payment platform by the DDGIT Delhi to collect the payments online which is managed and maintained by NSDL Database Management Ltd (NDML). The copy of contract agreement between NDML and Cantonment Board Allahabad for Payment Gateway of E-Chhawani portal is sent by NDML.

Relevant files are placed on the Table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 14: Board considered and approved & decided to finalize the agreement and forward the same to NDML for further action.**

**15. SUPPLY OF TRACTOR-TROLLEY & JCB FOR MILITARY CONSERVANCY.**

Reference CBR No. 6 dated 28.06.2023.

Due to delay in execution of contract agreement, supply of Tractor-Trolley & JCB for Military conservancy was provided by M/s Singh Builder & Contractors, Puramufti, Manauri Gate, Allahabad- 212208 for month of June & July, 2023.

Approval of Board is solicited for payment to M/s Singh Builder & Contractors, Puramufti, Manauri Gate, Allahabad- 212208 on submission bills for providing Tractor-Trolley & JCB for month of June & July, 2023.

Relevant files are placed on the Table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 15: Board considered and approved for payment to M/s Singh Builder & Contractors, Puramufti, Manauri Gate, Allahabad- 212208 on submission bills for providing Tractor-Trolley & JCB for month of June & July, 2023.**

**16. RUNNING OF CANTEEN IN PREMISES OF CANTONMENT GENERAL HOSPITAL, NEW CANTT, ALLAHABAD**

Tender for Running of Canteen in Premises of Cantonment General Hospital, New Cantt, Allahabad was invited vide Tender ID: 2023\_DGDE\_608968\_1 through e-tender uploading complete tender documents on Govt. e-procurement portal <https://defproc.gov.in/nicgep/app> with Rs. 5000/- as Reserve Bid Price per month.

Technical bid was opened on 26.07.2023 by the Tender Opening Committee and total 03 bids mentioned below are received:

Sl. No.	Bidder Name	Address
1.	Abhishekh Communication	21, Hasting Road, Near High Court, Civil Lines, Prayagraj.
2.	Dewsis	2, M. G. Marg, Opp. High Court, Hanuman Mandir, Prayagraj- 211001.
3.	Swastik Enterprises	21, Hasting Road, Near High Court, Civil Lines, Prayagraj.

Tender Opening Committee perused the documents uploaded in technical bids by above mentioned bidders. Based upon documents uploaded in Technical Bids, all three bidders qualified in Technical Bidding.

Financial bid of three technical qualified bidders has been opened on 27.07.2023 by Tender Opening Committee. Financial bids have been downloaded from e-procurement system and details of financial bid received are as under:-

Sl. No	Bidder Name	Quoted Bidding Price per Month in Rs.	Bid Rank
1.	Dewsis	6100.00	H1
2.	Abhishekh Communication	5800.00	H2
3.	Swastik Enterprises	5500.00	H3

Dewsis, 2, M. G. Marg, Opp. High Court, Hanuman Mandir, Prayagraj- 211001 has quoted highest Bidding Price per Month of Rs. 6100/- for Running of Canteen in Premises of Cantonment General Hospital, New Cantt, Allahabad and is reasonable in view of prevailing market and scope of works.

Relevant file is placed on the table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 16: Considered and Approved the highest Bidding Price per Month of Rs. 6,100/- quoted by Dewsis, 2, M. G. Marg, Opp. High Court, Hanuman Mandir, Prayagraj- 211001 for Running of Canteen in premises of Cantonment General Hospital, New Cantt, Allahabad. Board also laid emphasis on maintaining proper hygiene as per FSSAI standard, proper disposal of waste as Management of Solid Waste (MSW) Rule, 2016 and periodic inspection of the canteen to ensure compliance of contractual conditions.**

**17. TERM CONTRACT FOR REPAIR AND MAINTENANCE OF ROADS IN CANTT AREA ALLAHABAD FOR YEAR 2023-24**

Tender for Term Contract for Repair and Maintenance of Roads in Cantt Area Allahabad for Year 2023-24 was invited vide tender notice Advt. No. ENGG/2023-24/02/CBA/2023/1035 dated 11.07.2023 and Tender ID: 2023\_DGDE\_608616\_1 through e-tender uploading complete tender documents on Govt. e-procurement portal <https://defproc.gov.in/nicgep/app>. Tender notice dated 11.07.2023 was also uploaded on website of Cantt. Board and published in daily news papers "Amar Ujala" and "Times of India". Estimated cost of the work is Rs. 1,00,00,000/-.

Technical bid was opened on 22.07.2023 by the Tender Opening Committee and two bids mentioned below were received:

<b>Sl. No.</b>	<b>Bidder Name</b>	<b>Address</b>
<b>1.</b>	Mohammad Rizwan Contractor	86, Mahewa East, Naini, Allahabad
<b>2.</b>	M/s Mohd Aleem	Zameer Nagar Kareli Allahabad

Tender Opening Committee perused the documents uploaded in technical bids by above mentioned bidders. It was found that all bidders did not upload few documents required in the technical bids. Hence, the bidders were requested through e-portal on 25.07.2023 to submit short fall document. In response to Shortfall Document, Mohammad Rizwan Contractor submitted copy of ITR of FY 2022-23 and M/s Mohd Aleem intimated that their firm has not filed the ITR for FY 2022-23 as time period is available for filing of ITR. Since M/s Mohd Aleem submitted ITR of FYs 2017-18, 2018-19, 2019-20, 2020-21 & 2021-22, same has been accepted by the Tender Opening Committee.

Based upon documents uploaded in Technical Bids and Shortfall Document, both bidders qualified in Technical Bidding.

Financial bid of both technical qualified bidders has been opened on 31.07.2023 by Tender Opening Committee. Financial bids have been downloaded from e-procurement system and details of financial bid received are as under:-

<b>Sl. No</b>	<b>Bidder Name</b>	<b>Quoted percentage below MES SSR 2020 Rates</b>	<b>Bid Rank</b>
1.	Mohammad Rizwan Contractor	-22.70%	L1
2.	M/s Mohd Aleem	-13.12%	L2

Mohammad Rizwan Contractor, contractor has quoted lowest tender and is reasonable in view of prevailing market and scope of works.

Relevant file is placed on the table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 17: Board approved Mohammad Rizwan Contractor, 86, Mahewa East, Naini, Allahabad as L1 bidder (-22.70% as Quoted percentage below MES SSR 2020 Rates) for Term Contract for Repair and Maintenance of Roads in Cantt Area Allahabad for Year 2023-24 as per GFR 2017 Rule- 173 (xx).**

**18. MONITORING OF WORKS BEING EXECUTED BY THE CANTONMENT BOARDS**

Reference Principal Directorate, Defence Estates, Central Command, Lucknow Cantt letter No. 57708/MRT/Misc/LC8 dated 19.07.2023.

Directorate vide letter under reference intimated that MoD vide ID No. 621/2023-D(Q&C) dated 02.06.2023 has directed that a mechanism be put in place for sample test and third party inspection of civil works. Directorate has directed to put in place a system to ensure following for monitoring of works being executed by Cantonment Boards:

- a. Preparation of proper plans and estimates on works including for major repair/maintenance works & getting those approved by the Board.
- b. Preparation of proper tender documents after sanction of works is given by the Competent Authority.
- c. Engagement of a third party technical evaluator to check on execution of works (Testing of sample & inspection of works) from the Dept. of State Govt.

Dte, DE, CC, Lucknow letter No. 57708/MRT/Misc/LC8 dated 19.07.2023 is placed on the table.

Board to consider and note.

**CBR NO. 18: Board directed to obtain guidelines for sample test and third party inspection of civil works from MES, CPWD, PWD and then place fresh agenda in the next Board Meeting.**

**19. REGARDING COURT CASE - SPECIAL APPEAL (SPLA) 49 OF 2020, CANTONMENT BOARD ALLAHABAD VS RAJ KUMAR, EX- ASSISTANT TEACHER, CANTT BOARD ALLAHABAD**

It is submitted that Board has filed special appeal against the order passed by the Hon'ble Court in case No. Writ-A- 19674 of 2019, Raj Kumar Vs Cantonment Board Allahabad. It is pertinent to mention that the special appeal filed by the Board has not been listed for hearing, therefore this office issued several reminders and requested the concerned advocate to move an application for listing of special appeal at the earliest. However, after several reminders there has been no communication from the advocate on the said matter till date.

The Matter is placed on the table. Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 19: Board decided to provide final opportunity to the concerned Advocate for submitting his reply within a week. In case of no response from the Advocate, the advocate should be removed and barred from further hiring by Board.**

**20. PERMISSION FOR SETTING UP OF SHILP MELA SALE AT FOOTBALL GROUND SADAR BAZAR NEW CANTT. ALLD.**

Reference CBR No.22 dated 31-08-2022.

Vide CBR under reference Board considered request of Sugam Seva Samiti for organizing handloom handicrop khadi sale against the ground rent of Rs.55,000/-.

Now Kutir Udyog Rashtriya Ekta Vikas Pradarshini and Mela 14/15, Bada Tajiya, Jhonstonganj, Alld. has requested vide letter dated 31-07-2023 for permission for setting up of Fun World Pradarshani w.e.f. 10-08-2023 to 15-09-2023 at football ground Sadar Bazar New Cantt. Alld.

Said Samiti can be permitted to organize Fun World Pradarshani w.e.f. 10-08-2023 to 15-09-2023 at football ground Sadar Bazar New Cantt. Alld. at increased rate of 10% ground rent i.e Rs.60,500/-.

All relevant documents are placed on the table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 20: Considered and Approved by the Board. Board granted permission to Kutir Udyog Rashtriya Ekta Vikas Pradarshini and Mela 14/15, Bada Tajiya, Jhonstonganj, Alld to organize Fun World Pradarshani w.e.f. 10-08-2023 to 15-09-2023 at football ground Sadar Bazar New Cantt. Alld by paying ground rent of Rs.60,500/-.**

**21. PERMISSION FOR PARKING FEE COLLECTION FOR CYCLE, MOTOR CYCLE AND CAR AT SARASWATI GHAT FORT CANTT. ALLD.**

Board Vide CBR No.16 dated 28-02-2022 approved to collect parking fee for Cycle, Motor Cycle and Car at Saraswati Ghat Fort Cantt. Allahabad.

It is requested to permit parking fee collection right for Cycle, Motor cycle and Car at Saraswati Ghat Fort Cantt. Allahabad for revenue generation of Cantonment Board Allahabad.

All relevant documents are placed on the table.

Board to consider.

**CBR NO. 21: Board directed to organize a meeting between representatives of District Magistrate office, Prayagraj, OD Fort & Nagar Nigam Prayagraj for finalizing the modalities for smooth collection of Parking fee at Sarasawti Ghat Prayagraj.**

**SD/-  
Mohd. Sameer Islam  
Secretary/Member/Chief Executive Officer  
Cantonment Board, Allahabad**

**SD/-  
Brig. Maninder Singh Sidhu  
President  
Cantonment Board, Allahabad**

**True Copy**

**Office Superintendent  
Cantonment Board, Allahabad**